
The Immigration Debate Revisited

Link:

<https://stosselintheclassroom.org/both-sides-the-immigration-debate-revisited/>

Guide:

The questions below will help students achieve a better understanding of the arguments made on either side of a contentious topic. Because these questions often touch upon statements made briefly in the videos, we recommend reading the questions before watching each video.

Students are encouraged to take notes during the videos, and it may be helpful for students to break into groups, each taking responsibility for only a few questions, before coming together for discussion.

Analysis Questions:

1. What are the opposing ideas in these two videos?
2. The Stossel video showed that legal and illegal immigrants commit fewer crimes per capita than native-born Americans. Why do some politicians focus on "migrant crime" if migrants commit fewer crimes? Is it justified? Why/Why not?
3. Victor Davis Hanson said that America, at its founding, had the idea that "you could become an American if you crossed the borders and you accepted the American idea." What did he mean by "the American idea"?
4. In the Stossel video, Yaron Brook said "there is a real basis for people resenting that fact" that immigrants are sometimes given assistance by the government. What solution did he propose?
5. Victor Davis Hanson said that when immigrants came to America in the past, "they had skills, they spoke English." Should immigrants be required to have certain skills and speak English before they're allowed into the United States? Why/Why not?
6. John Stossel showed that illegal immigrants pay billions of dollars in taxes. Were you aware of that before watching this video? Does it change how you view illegal immigration? Why/Why not?
7. Victor Davis Hanson said that the United States has "lost confidence in its traditions and customs." What did he mean by this? Is he right? Why/Why not?
8. Yaron Brook said: "Every serious economic study has shown [immigrants] create more jobs than they destroy." Why do some politicians and media figures focus on the jobs that are lost, rather than the jobs that are created?
9. Victor David Hanson said that "the corporate establishment has been a big advocate of open borders." What reason did he give for this?

10. Yaron Brook said that restricting immigration is like saying "I have a right to stagnate and to force all of you to stagnate with me." What did he mean by this?
11. Victor Davis Hanson said: "[W]e look at the border and it is a construct, it doesn't exist in reality." What did he mean by this?
12. Yaron Brook proposed making immigration limited to people who have job offers in the United States. What are the pros and cons of such a system?
13. Both videos talked about "assimilation." What does assimilation mean in the context of immigration?
14. Did these two videos share any common ground? Were there any points on which they agreed? If so, what were they?
15. Should one of the arguments we heard carry more weight than the other? If so, which one? Why?
16. Did you have an opinion on this topic before watching these videos? If so, what was it? Has your opinion changed? If so, how? What did you learn from these videos that affects your views on this topic?
17. What else would you like to learn about this topic?
18. For more on this topic, see these previous editions of Both Sides of the Issue:
 - a. [Is Immigration a Human Right?](#)
 - b. [The Immigration Debate](#)
 - c. [Does Immigration Hurt the Economy?](#)